Nationalism Discourse, Tourism and Reconciliation

W.H.M.S. Samarathunga

Abstract

In most of the war-ridden countries achieving reconciliation is viewed as an unfeasible errand. Although there are few success stories including the case of South Africa, most of other post-conflict countries are squeezed with post-war empirical glitches. This is further tensed with the presence of ethnoreligious movements that emerges during and after the war. Countries in the Eastern world in particular are ridden by politically motivated ethnic, religious and nationalistic discourses. In this milieu, an Eastern post-war destination finds it extremely difficult to derive true reconciliation. The role of tourism to achieve reconciliation has been postulated as a viable elucidation to reach the aforementioned objective. Therefore, this viewpoint article examines the existing literature on nationalism, tourism, and reconciliation in order to propose a research agenda that will add to the body of knowledge.

Keywords: Post-War Research Agenda, Tourism And Reconciliation, Post-War Sri Lanka, Ethnic Nationalism, Civic Nationalism

Introduction

This paper is constructed under three main pillars: nationalism, reconciliation and tourism. Nationalism, with its two main branches: ethnic nationalism and civic nationalism, has evolved from modernism era to post-postmodernism

era despite of technological innovations, virtual economies and mass-destruction weapons. Backed by the historic evidence and mythology, people still tend to rely on some long-standing arguments on superior ethnic groups, religious groups and races over the other groups. This situation has introduced new challenges especially in the developing world where ethnoreligious nationalism still makes a significant influence on country's overall development process. Impact of ethno-religious nationalism and civic nationalism on tourism industry in particular are key concerns over the tourism academics worldwide. In this backdrop, it is important to understand how the tourism studies conducted in Sri Lankan context are influenced by either ethnic-nationalistic or civic-nationalistic discourses and what light is shed on tourism reconciliation.

Sri Lanka as a post-war destination is still facing the problem of ethnoreligious nationalism, reconciliation and other post-war empirical glitches. Reaching true reconciliation is necessary at a period where the overall development of the country is hindered due to the very same reasons. Although the short-sighted politicians and extremist groups are still in favor of ethno-religious nationalism there is a clear movement towards civic nationalism in the lenses of tourism. However, achieving reconciliation in the Sri Lankan postwar context was a challenged due to the ethno-religious nationalism (Pieris, 2014; Perera, 2016). The Sinhalese Buddhists who were visiting Jaffna had a special place in their mind on the specialty of Sinhalese Ethnic group, Buddhism and unitary status of the country. As a result, the ethno-religious nationalism did not support reaching reconciliation and widened the gap between the two communities. In contrary, after 2013, the ethno-religious nationalism began to fade away with the untiring efforts of the Sri Lankan government, civic society organizations and the general

public.

Many countries who had wars or tragic events in the recent past are promoting dark tourism at the places where deaths, genocides, suicides, and other destructions took place. Auschwitz in Germany (Biran et al. 2011), Ground Zero in New York (Lisle, 2004), Buchenwald concentration camp in Germany (Beech, 2000), Fort Siloso in Singapore (Muzaini, Teo and Yeoh, 2007), Cu-chi tunnels in Vietnam (Henderson, 2000; Alneng, 2002) are some of the examples. However, government support is inevitable to create a dark tourism gaze within a country (Yoshida et al. 2016). In the event of Sri Lanka, although a large number of people were killed during the three decades long brutal war, the government's decision is not to promote dark tourism at any place where the war took place (Perera, 2016) to rebuild the conciliation between the two main ethnic groups in Sri Lanka. Many scholars (Perera, 2016; Samarathunga, 2019; Dissanayake and Samarathunga, 2020; Samarathunga, Cheng and Weerathunga, 2020; Samarathunga, Cheng and Weerathunga, 2020; Samarathunga and Cheng, 2021) have extensively discussed about the development of post-war tourism in Sri Lanka in the light of ethno-religious nationalism and civic nationalism, yet the ground context on deriving reconciliation is far away from the reality. Therefore, this perspective article systematically review the existing literature on nationalism, tourism and reconciliation and attempts to put forward a research agenda to expand the body of knowledge while making plausible recommendations on empirical implications.

What is Nationalism?

The concept of nationalism possess an extended history and it goes back to the medieval period during which the people use to group together according to the color of skin, language they speak, common believes, common habits etc. Accordingly, they demarcated separate areas, lands and places to live in with their own groups. During the intra-group encounters, the member of the community performs many activities at the interest of the group there by protecting and promoting the mutual interests. This does not mean that the members of the same group living in the most fragile peace, but when they are tested they stand together because they have a bond and something to protect from the outside world. The discourse of nationalism emerges from this scenario.

However, when referring to the literature, one can find many explanations, definitions and associations of nationalism concept since it is a global and a multi-faced concept according to the context where it rises. When looking at the latest literature, many scholars are introducing nationalism as a modern concept which have following features according to Smith (2009): "a process of formation, or growth, of nations; a sentiment or consciousness of belonging to the nation, a language and symbolism of the nation; a social and political movement on behalf of the nation; a doctrine and/or ideology of the nation, both general and particular" (p.5).

Since the features of nationalism encompasses a vast spectrum of philosophy, it is expected to discuss only related components of it which is relevant to this thesis; through the language, through sociopolitical movements and the notion of nation. Language is one of the main components in nationalism that separate groups from one nation from the other (Dumezil, 1958; Calhoun, 1997). For instance, in Sri Lanka, one of the main differences between the Sinhalese and the Tamils is that both groups speak two separate languages: Sinhalese and Tamil (Perera, 2016).

When constructing nationalism, national symbols have a high value which is known as 'symbolism' (Smith, 2009). The national symbols,

unarguably, should represent the interests of all the people in a nation and should be able to communicate the distinct characteristic of the nation. When creating national flags, national anthems, national emblems, and constructing national buildings, one of the key criterions that the authorities are paying attention is their representativeness. These national symbols should be able to unite different ethnic groups of a country provoking their nationalism and patriotism, than that of their ethnic origins. How Sri Lanka faced this challenge in terms of the Sri Lankan national language, national flag, and national anthem will be discussed in a subsequent section (Hobsbawm and Ranger, 1983; Moss, 1990).

Therefore, when defining nationalism it need to be considered how the nationalism is formed, i.e. through the language, customs, anthems and so on (Smith, 1995). However, it should be mentioned that a many of authors (Brubaker, 1992, 1996; Tishkov, 2000; Triandafyllidou, 2001). Nevertheless, for the purpose of this study, we adopt the following definition introduced by Smith (2009): "An ideological movement for attaining and maintaining autonomy, unity and identity for a population which some of its members deem to constitute an actual or potential nation" (p.9).

Ethnicity, Nationalism and Tourism

Ethnicity is an exclusive concept that has many hypothetical interpretations in it. The ethnicity is also related to grouping of people based on similar characteristics, mainly the ethnic group they were born to (Yang & Wall, 2009). As per MacCannell (1984) the ethnicity is referred to the difference between one group to the other mainly through the bio-genetic connotations of race and socio-genetic ideas of culture. Eriksen (1997) explains the ethnicity in two ways. Firstly, according to the daily language, ethnicity is associated with minority and majority issues, race issues. Secondly, it also

denotes to different aspects of social relationships and encounters between different groups of people who have perceived themselves as different from the other according to their own culture. Most sociologists try to clarify ethnicity according the territorial, racial, economic, cultural, religious and linguistic features (De Vos and Romanucci-Ross, 1995). According to Winthrop (1991) ethnicity can be generally defined as the "existence of culturally distinctive groups within a society, each asserting a unique identity on the basis of a shared tradition and distinguishing social markers such as a language, religion, or economic specialization" (p.94).

However, the definition forwarded by De Vos (1995) is much simpler in nature regarding ethnicity. According to him "it is a feeling of continuity with a real or imagined past, a feeling that is maintained as an essential part of one's self-definition" (p.25). On the other hand, Nagel (1995) refer to ethnicity as "difference in language, religion, color, ancestry, and/or culture to which social meanings are attributed and around which identity and group formation occurs" (p.61). If we closely look at these definitions, the common features that can be observed is that ethnicity is closely associated with cultural identities which is also bounded with ancestral hereditariness and deep-rooted kinship ties.

Many local communities have perceived tourists from different nationalities are different from each other and their behavior is different from each other. Many researchers including Brewer (1984), Milman and Pizam (1995), Pi-Sunyer and Salzmann (1978) noted different behaviors of the tourists at a destination who come from different country. According to them, the behavior, attitude and morality and how they spend the vacation also have notable differences. But when it comes to the domestic tourists who are visiting tourist destinations, they miss to identify the differences

among the tourists but note the differences in between the tourists and themselves in terms of behavior and attitude (Pizam & Telisman-Kosuta, 1989).

Nationality effects on tourists behavior to a greater extent (Milman and Pizam, 1995; Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996). In his study Pizam (1999) made an attempt to identify the perception of Korean, British, Dutch and Israeli tour guides' perception on different types of tourists they encounter with. As a common finding it can be identified that these tour guides have well noted the differenced among tourist groups according to their nationality, with respect to the attitude and behavior. Although there are previous studies exploring the differences among tourists according to their nationality, the literature has not addressed the area of how the local tourists behave according to their backgrounds. This dearth of research gap is surprising, since the national cultures and their effects on tourist behavior are of importance.

Differentiating Ethnic Nationalism and Civic Nationalism

When talking of nationalism, there are two aspects of arguments that we cannot avoid of: ethnic nationalism and civic nationalism. It was Hans Kohn who first clearly distinguished these two concept through his book of "The Idea of Nationalism" (Kohn, 1944). According to him, the civic nationalism was originated from England in the 17th century, which was spread to France in the eighteenth. The Western nationalism, alias civic nationalism, grounded on masses with the nation with a well vested political structure. It is this rational which is standing to date giving lives to the modern states. The second type, the Eastern nationalism, alias ethnic nationalism, is constructed around the distinct cultural identities of each state concerned. Kohn (1944) further argues that the ethnic nationalism keep on amending the political

rights of the citizens with ethnographic demands. One of the major differences between the ethnic nationalism and civic nationalism, according to Kohn (1944), is that Western nationalism is originated on political liberty and the rights of the residents which are always rational. On the other hand, Eastern nationalism was grounded on the history, ancient practices, or on monuments that might go back to the tribal era (p.574). Thus, Kohn introduces civic nationalism as more liberal and ethnic nationalism as illiberal (Kuzio, 2002)

Ignatieff (1993) and argues that civic nationalism is similar to democracy because it suggests that a nation should be home to everyone irrespective of the color, race, believes, language or the ethnicity while ethnic nationalism encourage a particular group with common characteristics to live an govern together. On the other hand Lecours (2000) argues that civic nationalism is evolved around the subjective definitions that ignore the free will of the people, while the same author states, ethnic nationalism is constructed on the objective definitions that include religious, language and ethnic origin to measure the membership. Accordingly, ethnic nationalism is visible in Asia, Eastern Europe and Africa where as the civic nationalism is connected to the modern West. Nairn (1993) briefly state the highlighting points of Kohn's dichotomy; the Western ideology was "original, institutional, liberal and good and the Eastern ideology was reactive, envious, ethnic, racist and generally bad" (p.23).

Xenos (1996) pointed out a vital element in civic nationalism that can reinstate a collective identity among the people in a state with the common notion of patriotism. It further value liberal democracy with particular national heritage than that of language or blood. Lecours (2000) use the ethnic-civic modelaties to draw a line between a traditional and a modern society.

The study conducted by Ignatieff (1993) on "Blood and Belonging: Journeys into the New Nationalism" covering Northern Ireland, Canada, Ukraine, Serbia, Croatia, Germany and Kurdistan, concluded that "the only reliable antidote to ethnic nationalism turns out to be civic nationalism, because the only guarantee that ethnic groups will live side by side in peace is shared loyalty to a state strong enough, fair enough, equitable enough to command their obedience" (p.243). This is a clear message on the political standpoint of civic nationalism to different ethnic and religious groups that they are welcome to live in if they stand according to the rules and regulations of the nation (Xenos, 1996).

Although most studies (Raymond, 1988; Xenos, 1996; Lecours, 2000; Shulman, 2004; Nairn, 2012) on civic nationalism and ethnic nationalism are favoring civic nationalism, the recent scholars have started to question it's applicability in every context. As a result scholars have forwarded many papers arguing on both sides. "The myth of the civic state: a critical survey of Hans Kohn's framework for understanding nationalism" by (Kuzio, 2002) and "The myth of the civic nation" by (Yack, 1996) are two such investigating paper. Ignatieff (1993) also questions how to accommodate ethnic, religious and cultural diversity within civic nationalism. Further he questions on securing the basic rights and compatibility with minority rights. Smith (2005) brings the reader's attention on the use of state violence to secure the civic nationalism, especially on political cases. Xenos (1996) states that the contemporary writers keep on quoting everything good about the civic nationalism and everything bad

about ethnic nationalism. Thus, it is imperative to develop a balance discourse on both ethnic and civic nationalism and question the suitability of the either of the concept and to adopt the best practices of both since these are hypothetical phenomenons.

identified few issues vested with the Kohn's Kuzio (2002) framework on nationalism. Firstly, Kohn has disregarded anti-democratic and ethnic nationalism concepts that have prevailed in the West. Similarly, he has ignored the Western nationalisms that prevailed in the East. Thus, he has worn some shades when defining West and East, West being good and East being bad (Symonolewicz-Symmons, 1965). Secondly, based on Kohn's artificial geographical distribution of nationalisms, the preceding organizations that work on civic and ethnic problems in the world, only pay attention to the problems in the East. Such organizations do not interfere with the ethnic issues in the Yugoslavian region (Croatia, Bosnia and Kosovo), Moldovan region and the Russian region (Chechnya). Further, the European ethnic issues are still not attended to. They include the issues in France (Corsica, Brittany), United Kingdom (Northern Ireland), Canada (Quebec), Belgium (Flanders), and Spain (Basque). Kuzio (2002) further highlights that these ethnic issues are still on going and even turn in to violence often.

Thirdly, Kuzio (2002) highlights the absence of rights of Native Indians living in America along with the rights of blacks, which was suspended throughout eleven states in America while he was writing his nationalism discourse. Despite of the encroachments in to the Indian lands, slavery of the blacks and all the discriminations he named the West as the place where civic nationalism is best practiced. Fourthly, Kohn has forgotten that time changes everything. He has already named West as civic-centric

and East as ethno-centric. But in the modern world we can see the gradual movements of ethno-centric countries in to the civic-centralism (Aner, 2000). For example, the decline of USSR and the emergence of modern Russian Federation. Similarly, China and India has also made some major reforms in their policies in describing their nationalism policies. Fifthly, Brubaker (1996) points out loss of important traditional and cultural values during the nation building process. For instance, civic states like France has lost some of their cultural values during the process of becoming a part of a civic state (Kuzio, 2002).

Review of literature on both ethnic nationalism and civic nationalism reveals that there is no particular concept that attend best to the ethnic issues in any context. Since both concepts carry their own limitations, it is vital to carry out further studies with the concept of nationalism to understand how it can be best employed to attend to ethnic issues and thereby drive a country forward. Although it is hard to jump to a brand-new concept while forgetting its history, culture and certain incident like war, necessary actions can be taken to lay a good foundation in bringing a suitable nationalism concept to the modern world. We believe that Sri Lanka will be an ideal breeding ground to apply civic nationalism concept with the intention of deriving reconciliation to put an end to the long-lasting ethnic issues that dragged the country backwards.

Development of Post-war Tourism Literature on Post-war Tourism

There have been relatively a short number of tourism related publications reported during the post-war period of Sri Lanka. This could be due to the reason that there are only three Universities that offer tourism education and each of them are having a relatively few qualified tourism academics.

Further, before 2010, Sri Lanka was in the misperception that LTTE could not be won over through a military involvement and the tourism academics were not interested about conducting in depth studies about Jaffna or Northern Province of Sri Lanka. However, after 2010, both local and foreign academics paid their attention to the post-war tourism boom, but with the exception of tourism in Jaffna. Jaffna, was however, was a good research field among the social scientists who have been investigating on the fields of war and peace, human rights violations, internally displaced people, and migration.

Immediately after the war in Sri Lanka, Institute of Policy Studies (IPS) of Sri Lanka broke this silence through their exploratory study on "Post-Conflict Tourism Development in Sri Lanka" (Institute of Policy Studies of Sri Lanka, 2010) which spoke of both prospects and challenges of tourism development in the former war zone. The institute highlights the unavailability of tourism in both North and Eastern Provinces of the country before the end of the war. IPS also highlight the fact that the two provinces combinely accumulate of around 29 percent of land in the country which are largely underutilized. Much of the local researchers (Buultjens, Ratnayake, & Gnanapala, 2016; Fernando & Jayawardena, 2013; Fernando, Bandara, Liyanaarachch, et al., 2013; Fernando, Bandara, & Smith, 2013; Liyanage & Jayawardena, 2013; Lokuhetty, Jayawardena, & Mudadeniya, 2013; Ranasinghe, 2018; Samarathunga, WHMS; Cheng, 2019) who researched about post-war tourism in Sri Lanka did not miss to talk about the post-war tourism boom that has been doubled over few years with a double digit growth rate since the end of the war. Out of them, the study conducted by Fernando, Bandara, & Smith (2013) assessed the economic loss that Sri Lanka faced due to the war situation.

One of the few studies conducted about tourism in Jaffna, before the end of the war has been "The effect of war and other factors on Sri Lankan tourism" (Selvanathan, 2007). Selvanathan (2007) emphasis that the ongoing war has controlled the tourism growth of Sri Lanka. Further, he shows how tourism operated in the Southern part of Sri Lanka despite of the war situation. Ranasinghe (2018) also supports the previous claim. He mentions that the long-fought war has impacted not only the tourism industry but also the sustainable socio-economic growth of the country by large. Further, the negative effect of war on trade, commerce and investment were also discussed in this article. Ranasinghe (2018) continues to mention about the decrease of people's living standard due to the war. Although LTTE did not target the tourism industry particularly, the impact of the war upon the tourism industry is huge and is accountable as big as 21 percent (Selvanathan, 2007). Out of many reasons, the international media has contributed for the decrease of tourist arrival to Sri Lanka before the end of the war (Gamage, 1997). As a result, the tourists had started suspecting about their safety during the tour in Sri Lanka, Gamage (1997) further add. Similar to the above researchers, Bandara (1997) also stated that the war has negatively impacted on the economic and tourism growth of Sri Lanka.

The post-war tourism boom was also among the attention of the Sri Lankan researchers due to its distinct nature. Sri Lanka Tourism Development Autority (2019) records a double-digit tourism growth rate since 2010, which made Sri Lanka a popular tourist destination to visit. Further to that, Lonely Planet, a popular travel advisory website nominated Sri Lanka as the number 1 destination to visit in 2011 (Fernando & Jayawardena, 2013). By looking at this unstoppable tourism growth, Fernando et al. (2013) mention that tourism revenue could contribute to country's foreign exchange earnings and thereby to ease the pressure on the

balance of payment in Sri Lanka. Lokuhetty et al. (2013) recognize the postwar promotional activities of the government that supported post war tourism boom in Sri Lanka.

Out of few studies conducted on post-war tourism potentials, the study conducted by Japan Consortium for International Cooperation in Cultural Heritage on "Protection and Utilization of Cultural Property in the Northern and Northeastern Provinces of Sri Lanka" stands tall (Japan Consortium for International Cooperation in Cultural Heritage, 2015). This survey has identified 29 tourist attractions within the Jaffna district. They Jaffna Fort, Jaffna Library, Jaffna Old Kachcheri Building Archaeological Site, Archaeological Museum, Mazrauddeen School, Nallur Kandaswamy Kovil, University of Jaffna, Mandri Manai, Sangili Topu and Foundation base belonging to Sangili (Changiliyan) Palace, Yamunari Pond, Nilavarai. Kantharodai Buddhist Site. Maviddapuram Temple, Naguleswaram Temple, Dambakola Patuna, Theru Modi Madam. Vallipuram, St. Antonius Church, Vadamarachchi, Fort Hammenhiel, Naga Pooshani Amman Temple, Nagadipa Vihara, Ancient Buddhist Site in Delft, Ancient Hindu Site in Delft, Wild Horses, Old Dutch Hospital, Pigeon House, Baobab Tree, Old Dutch Fort (Japan Consortium for International Cooperation in Cultural Heritage, 2015).

Similarly, Institute of Policy Studies of Sri Lanka (2010) also recognized many natural and cultural places in both North and Eastern Provinces that has tourism potentials. The IPS highlights the pristine beaches that found in abundance along the coastal boarders of North and East Provinces which have not been utilized so far. The cultural attractions that include mosques, temples, churches, festivals are found to be important attractions that can attract both local and foreign tourists. The Institute of

Policy Studies of Sri Lanka (2010) further emphasis the need of developing Jaffna as a tourist destination to manage the overcrowding southern destinations. Ranasinghe (2018) analyzed the heritage and cultural resources within the Jaffna peninsula that could be in cooperated in tourism development plans of Jaffna. He categorizes the the attractions in to six main sets: "historical — historical monuments, memorable places of significant events; Archeological-archeological monuments, ruins and places of excavations; Cultural-festivals, folklore, traditions and way of life; Ethnographic-ethnic groups, ethnic food and creations, cultures, language and outfit; Religious-rituals and ceremonies, relics and pilgrimage places, beliefs and religious constructions; Ecological-natural landscapes, wetlands, forest covers and wild life (Ranasinghe, 2018, p6)

Through their study, Fernando, Bandara, Liyanaarachch, et al. (2013) highlighted the abject poverty that was prevailing within the post-war regions in Sri Lanka. In order to alleviate this situation, they proposed tourism as a catalyst that can generate employment opportunities, earn foreign currency and to promote economic growth at the post-war areas. A different study, however, identified the post-war development related issues that include alleged human rights violations and war crimes, problems related to the rehabilitation process of the former LTTE carders, resettlement or the internally displaced people (IDP) and post-war development (Fernando, Bandara, & Smith, 2013). Immediately after the war, the Board of Investment (BOI) has granted sizable tax concessions and incentives to boost the investments in Sri Lanka (Institute of Policy Studies of Sri Lanka, 2010). This tax relief scheme did not only aim at promoting the general investments, but also the tourism investments. Buultjens et al. (2016) identified the mismatches between the North and Eastern Provinces and

Southern Provinces in terms of development. They highlighted the fact that war has restricted development to reach the North and Eastern parts of the country.

Immediately after the war, the government introduced a five year tourism plan "Tourism Development Strategy 2011 – 2016" (Ministry of Economic Development, 2011). The strategic document is very clear on its vision, "The development policy framework of the Government of Sri Lanka is committed to a sustainable tourism development strategy, wherein, protection of the environment and distribution of economic benefits to the larger cross section of the society are key components of this overall vision" (Ministry of Economic Development, 2011, p.4). The key targets set by the strategic documents were: "to increase tourist arrivals from 650,000 in 2010 to 2.5 Mn by 2016; to attract USD 3,000 Mn as Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) to the country within 5 years; to increase the tourism related employment from 125,000 in 2010 to 500,000 by 2016 and expand tourism based industry and services all island; to distribute the economic benefits of tourism to a larger cross section of the society and integrate tourism to the real economy; to increase the foreign exchange earnings from USD 500 million in 2010 to USD 2.75 billion by 2016; to contribute towards improving the global trade and economic linkages of Sri Lanka; to position Sri Lanka as the world's most treasured island for tourism" (p.3). However, it is unfortunate to see that the post-war first tourism plan does not focus on tourism in war-affected areas or to promote the domestic tourism.

De Silva (2010) highlights this noteworthy absence. According to him, the policies should be flexible and should try to promote equal and fair distribution of benefits. Accordingly, the North and East must be included in the process of reconstruction, reconciliation and tourism development. In

destination planning and development IPS recommends to get the support of the local community since the inception (Institute of Policy Studies of Sri Lanka, 2010) to avoid any potential host-guest clashes. Therefore, the IPS proposed to implement a holistic and an integrated approach in the tourism planning and development process. Further to that, the tourism projects should focus on alleviating the poverty, development of livelihood and development of infrastructure. After closely observing the ongoing post-war tourism development projects Lokuhetty et al. (2013) propose six key strategies aimed at tourism development in the Northern province. They include reconstruction work; conservation; rebuilding communities; rebuilding tourism brand; expanding tourism research; restructuring tourism bureaucracies. In the meantime, Dilogini and Hensman (2014) redirect the post-war development attention to the destination image. According to them, the war has tarnished the image of Jaffna as a tourist destination. They further recommend tourism as the best industry to that can develop the area quickly.

Both de Silva (2010), and Fernando and Jayawardena (2013) identified the issues related to infrastructure. For instance, absence of quality roads tops other related issues. The post-war military behavior is subject to controversies. Within the Sri Lankan context, the military has expanded their traditional role as the national security force and entered in to many industries including hospitality and farming. Ratnayake and Hapugoda (2016) wrote extensively on the post-war military involvement in civil affairs and the subsequent issues of it. During the three decades of war, Sri Lankan government forces has stationed at different places in the Northern Province providing needed security to the region. After the war, some of those lands have been converted in to farms or resorts. As a result, the displaced people have nowhere to go within their home town. Therefore, the local community

has developed a misperception about the tourism development in the region (Ratnayake and Hapugoda, 2016). The issues between the post-war tourists to Jaffna and the Tamils hosts were also discussed in the post-war tourism literature. Pieris (2014) identified language as the main issue that obstruct successful relationship between the Sinhalese guests and Tamil hosts.

Wickramasinghe (2013) was much concerned about the travel behavior of the Southern tourists in North since they have been motivated by the government to visit the Northern Buddhist sites and the war attractions. As a result Wickramasinghe (2013) suspects that Tamils feel neglected at their own home since the Sinhalese people do not value and respect the Tamil culture. Pieris (2014) further pointed out in her study on some hostilities exhibited by few southern Sinhalese travelers who were not allowed to visit the Jaffna Library due to an ongoing seminar. That type of behaviors are possibly motivated by the triumphalist mindset created by the government. The other incident that affected the harmony in Jaffna had been decorating the entire Jaffna town with Buddhist flags and other Buddhist emblems to commemorate the Vesak Festival in 2014. Pieris (2014) however reports that this was done by the army soldiers who were stationed in Jaffna with their religious faith.

In a comparative note, non-Sri Lankan scholars have also contributed to the Sri Lankan war and tourism literature under different themes including: tourism potentials in Jaffna, poverty reduction and investments, government policy decisions, military involvement in tourism and domestic tourism that disrupt the existing reconciliation process.

Immediately after the war, the New York Times in USA identified 31 places to visit in 2010. According to the list, Sri Lanka became the number one destination to visit in 2010 (New York Times, 2010). Following New York Times, Lonely Planet identified Sri Lanka as one of the tope

destinations to travel in 2013 (Kamble and Bouchon, 2014). Although this publicity could earn enormous advantages to promote Sri Lanka as a must visit destination, it is doubtful whether Sri Lanka really got any outcome of it. Tourism can be used as a quick tool to develop a war affected destination (Neumayer, 2004; Hall, 2010). In this light Upadhayaya, Mu "ller-Bo"ker, and Sharma (2011) state that tourism also has the ability to promote the socio-political reconciliation at a post-conflict setting. Novelli, Morgan, and Nibigira (2012) continue to argue that tourism development can diversify and regenerate the economic activities, alleviate poverty and promote peace. During their discussion on post-war tourism development in Sri Lanka, Kamble and Bouchon (2014) stated that tourism can be promoted in Sri Lanka especially with the untouched natural resources lies in the North and East provinces of the country. They further recommend Special Interest Tourism as a strategy to reach reconciliation. Whilst emphasizing the importance of local residents receiving the tourism benefits, Kamble and Bouchon (2014) further suggest to promote 'War Tourism' with the light of storytelling of the experience related to war, survival and aftermath.

The foreign scholars have paid much attention on the post-war government policy decisions and investments. Kamble and Bouchon (2014) has recognized the 'Sri Lankan Tourism Development Strategy 2011-2016' but they are also in suspect whether it promotes needed reconciliation to Sri Lanka. The strategic documents has only paid attention to economic benefits. The same document has failed to introduce regional specific plans (Kamble and Bouchon, 2014) and importantly Northern province has totally been missed during the process. Kamble and Bouchon (2014) suggest that this strategic document should have direct the tourism industry to enhance the socio-economic well-being of the war affected areas spatially and ethnically. Further, Buultjens et al., (2016) identify that although the government is in

the process of expanding tourism, the government has not recognized the informal sector in the tourism industry. However, they also highly recommends the use of tourism industry as a gateway to address post-war economic issues.

Buultjens et al. (2016) note that the government is paying much attention on mega scale tourism projects while neglecting the informal sector. Also, they wonder how the informal sector has proceeded since the cessation of the war. Buultjens et al. (2016) further warns over this irreversible negligence since the informal sector contributes for economic diversification. Construction of a tourism zone in Kalpitiya area can be considered as a large scale tourism project which ignored the informal sector of the economy. According to Tjolle (2011) many people who have occupied the land without having proper titles have been chased away by the government and had sold those lands to the private sector. The community people who represent the agriculture, fisheries and tourism industry have been highly impacted by this decision. Kamble and Bouchon (2014) therefore suggests that the tourism investments should be encourage but without eliminating the small players in the industry especially in the North and Eastern areas. In their study Kamble and Bouchon (2014) further identified that the slow growth of the North and Eastern areas due to the post war issues that include landmines, and disputes and settlement issues of displaced Tamil people.

Similar to the local academics, the foreign academics also identified the unnecessary militarization in the post-war area. Geospatial Technologies and Human Rights Project of USA has identified that Sri Lanka military has shiftily moved in to tourism and agriculture operations after the war (Geospatial Technologies and Human Rights Project, 2014). Accordingly,

the military is in the service of accommodation sector, restaurant business, airlines and whale watching (Buultjens, Ratnayake and Gnanapala, 2016). Fonseka and Jegatheeswaran (2013) worry about this military appropriation that restrict the internally displaced people to return to their home lands after cessation of the war. Buultjens et al. (2016) printout the 'Thalsevana Resort' which is owned and operated by Sri Lanka Army on a land once belong to the Tamil fisherman before the military appropriated that area.

Kamble and Bouchon (2014) continue to question the government's post-war tourism development plans highlighting the tourism projects are mainly cornered to the southern parts of the country. Therefore, the question they present are: is the government really pay attention on Northern and the Eastern provinces? Are the people of North and East are benefitting out of tourism? Are the economic benefits are equally being distributed among the people living in North and Eastern parts of the country? Kamble and Bouchon (2014) also make it a point to warn about the host-guest relationship at the post-war region since the people living in North and Eastern areas have suffered a lot due to the war situation. Therefore, the visitors cannot expect them to be friendly and cheerful with them since they have more problems to solve in their daily life. Hyndman (2015) wonders why the government has removed only selected war attractions, not all. He questions whether the government needs people to remember what they want them to remember.

Tourism and Reconciliation

In Sri Lanka, the dark tourist gaze was constructed through the ethnonationalistic tourist gaze during the post war travels (Samarathunga, Cheng and Weerathunga, 2020). Immediately after the war Southern tourists flocked in to the Northern Province with the quest of gazing upon the war remnants (Buultjens et al. 2016, Kamble and Bouchon 2014, Pieris 2014) backed by triumphalism, the notion of unitary status and Buddhist hegemony. But, after Sri Lankan government's decision over the war attractions, the military started systematically removing the war attractions in the Northern Province (Perera, 2016). Former LTTE leader's bunker, ancestral home, sea tigers' training swimming pool, the Mahaweerar (great heroes') cemeteries are some of the dark tourism sites which were removed. Systematic removal of such attraction has altered the tourists' gaze on the Northern Province. As a result, now civic nationalistic tourist gaze has replaced the ethno-religious nationalistic tourist gaze (Pieris, 2014; Perera, 2016; WHMS Samarathunga, Cheng and Weerathunga, 2020; WHMS. Samarathunga, Cheng and Weerathunga, 2020). The ongoing reconciliation effort, the concerns of the United Nation Human Right Council (UNHRC) are some of the reasons behind removal of war remnants.

Many local and foreign scholars also noted the need of reaching reconciliation in the post-war region. de Silva (2010) identified reaching the reconciliation as the biggest challenge Sri Lanka is facing during the post war period. de Silva (2010) also paid attention to the truth and reconciliation commission which was formed by the Rajapakse government. Although this commission has paid attention to the South African model of a 'Desmond Tutu-led Reconciliation Commission' it cannot be fully in cooperated to the

Sri Lankan context since it is totally different to the South African issues. In reaching reconciliation de Silva (2010) is in a doubt of availability of a committed personal in Sri Lanka similar to Desmond Tutu. Moufakkir and Kelly (2010) noted some non-judiciary methods to establish reconciliation in Sri Lanka. One of such methods includes organizing cricket matches between the Northern Schools and Southern Schools by few NGO's. It is assumed that this type of actions play a significant role in delivering peace through understanding each other and enhancing unity through dialogue and building team-spirit.

In the process of achieving reconciliation, Fernando, Bandara, and Smith (2013) shows the importance having a stable political environment which can be achieved through the rehabilitation, reconstruction and a versatile reconciliation process. While acknowledging the achievements made by the government in the areas of rehabilitating ex-LTTE members, resettlement of IDPs, Fernando, Bandara, and Smith (2013) reminds the government to find a long-lasting political solution. Lokuhetty et al., (2013) also emphasis the need of establishing long lasting peace which is a prerequisite of attracting millions of tourists to Sri Lanka. Pieris (2014) identifies the post war triumphalism and continuous criticisms of the Tamil nationalistic groups as a hindrance to reach reconciliation. Immediately after the war the former Defense Secretary, the present President, Gotabaya Rajapakse, implemented a '5R' strategy for post-war development. They include: "Reconstruction, Resettlement, Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Reconciliation" (Hyndman, 2015). Through his latest publication Pannilage (2017) states that although the armed struggle is over, the government still has to address its root causes. Whilst admiring the initiatives taken by the government for the physical development of the areas, Pannilage (2017) suggests the government to implement a workable mechanism to address the burning grass-root level issues and the issues related to government policies and systems.

Conclusion

The review of the literature on post-war tourism development by both national and foreign scholars emphasis the noteworthy literature gap on how determining factors like ethnic nationalism and civic nationalism affect to the post-war tourism development in Sri Lanka that has a direct influence on establishing reconciliation at the formerly war ridden destination. Further, there are no studies related to perspectives of both Tamil and Sinhalese people on reconciliation, how post war travels could promote reconciliation, impact on hemogenic symbolism at the post-war destinations. In addition to that existing tug-of-war between the regional government and the national government have detrimental impacts over achieving the reconciliation which again fueled by the extremist diaspora movements.

People do not hate each other but the government, organizations, and social movements do. The dilemmas associated with the first movements towards reaching reconciliation should not be considered as acts of fearfulness or shameful. Instead, reconciliation that comes out of the depth of the heart of the people has to be decorated with flowers, pride and warm hugs. Sri Lanka truly needs to change its politically motivated ethnonationalistic propagandas and promote civic nationalism to a better and a brighter future through tourism.

References

Alneng, V. (2002) 'What the Fuck Is a Vietnam?': Touristic Phantasms and the Popcolonization of (the) Vietnam (War)', *Critique of Anthropology*, 22(4), pp. 461–489.

- Aner, S. (2000) 'Nationalism in central Europe A chance or a threat for the emerging liberal democratic order?', *East European Politics and Society*, 14(2), pp. 213–245.
- Bandara, J. S. (1997) 'The impact of the civil war on tourism and the regional economy', *South Asia: Journal of South Asia Studies*, 20(May), pp. 269–279. doi: 10.1080/00856409708723315.
- Beech, J. (2000) 'The enigma of holocaust sites as tourist attractions-the case of Buchenwald. Managing Leisure', *Managing Leisure*, 5(1), pp. 29–41.
- Biran, A., Poria, Y. and Oren, G. (2011) 'SOUGHT EXPERIENCES AT (DARK)', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 38(3), pp. 820–841. doi: 10.1016/j.annals.2010.12.001.
- Brewer, J. D. (1984) 'Tourism and ethnic stereotypes: Variations in a Mexican town', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 11(3), pp. 487–501.
- Brubaker, R. (1992) *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany*.

 Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Brubaker, R. (1996) Nationalism Reframed: Nationhood and the National Question in the New Europe. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Buultjens, J. W., Ratnayake, I. and Gnanapala, W. K. A. C. (2016) 'Post-Conflict tourism development in Sri Lanka: implications for building resilience', *Current Issues in Tourism*, 19(4), pp. 355–372. doi: 10.1080/13683500.2014.1002760.

Calhoun, C. (1997) *Nationalism*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Dilogini, K. and Hensman, G. H. (2014) 'Perspective of Tourism Marketing in the Post-War Jaffna District: A Phenomenological Research', *Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development*, 5(27), pp. 161–169.

- Dissanayake, D. and Samarathunga, W. (2020) 'Post-war City to a Tourism

 City: the Perspectives of Local Stakeholders on Post-war City Tourism

 Development in Jaffna, Sri Lanka', *International Journal of Tourism Cities*.

 doi: 10.1108/IJTC-05-2020-0111.
- Dumezil, G. (1958) L'ideologie tripartite des Indo-Europeens. Brussels.
- Eriksen, T. H. (1997) 'Ethnicity, race and nation', in Guiberanu, M. and Rex, J. (eds) *The ethnicity reader*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Fernando, P. and Jayawardena, C. (Chandi) (2013) 'Focusing on realistic tourism targets for post-war Sri Lanka', *Worldwide Hospitality and Tourism Themes*, 5(5), pp. 495–504. doi: 10.1108/WHATT-05-2013-0031.
- Fernando, S. *et al.* (2013) 'Political Violence and Volatility in International Tourist Arrivals: The Case of Sri Lanka', *Tourism Analysis*, 18(5), pp. 575–586. doi: 10.3727/108354213X13782245307876.
- Fernando, S., Bandara, J. S. and Smith, C. (2013) 'Regaining Missed Opportunities: The Role of Tourism in Post-war Development in Sri Lanka', *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 18(7), pp. 685–711. doi: 10.1080/10941665.2012.695284.
- Fonseka, B. and Jegatheeswaran, D. (2013) *Politics policies and practices* with land acquisitions and related issues in the North and East of Sri Lanka. Colombo: Centre for Policy Alternatives.
- Geospatial Technologies and Human Rights Project (2014) *Monitoring Change in Sri Lanka's Valikamam High Security Zone: 2009–2014.* Washington, DC.
- Hall, C. M. (2010) 'Crisis events in tourism: Subjects of crisis in tourism', *Current Issues in Tourism*, 13, pp. 401–417.
- Haralambopoulos, N. and Pizam, A. (1996) 'Perceived Impacts of Tourism: The Case of Samos', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 23(3), pp. 503–526.

- doi: 10.1016/0160-7383(95)00075-5.
- Henderson, J. C. (2000) 'War as a tourist attraction: the case of Vietnam', *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 2(4), pp. 269–280. doi: 10.1002/1522-1970(200007/08)2:4<269::aid-jtr219>3.0.co;2-a.
- Hobsbawm, E. and Ranger, T. (1983) *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hyndman, J. (2015) 'The Securitisation of Sri Lankan Tourism in the Absence of Peace', *Stability: International Journal of Security & Development*, 4(1), pp. 1–16. doi: 10.5334/sta.fa.
- Ignatieff, M. (1993) *Blood and Belonging: Journeys into the New Nationalism*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.
- Institute of Policy Studies of Sri Lanka (2010) *Post-Conflict Tourism*Development in Sri Lanka, Sri Lanka: State of the Economy 2010.

 Colombo.
- Japan Consortium for International Cooperation in Cultural Heritage (2015)

 Survey Report on the Protection and Utilisation of Cultural Property in the Northern and Northeastern Provinces of Sri Lanka. Tokyo.
- Kamble, Z. and Bouchon, F. (2014) 'Tourism Planning and a Nation's Vision: A
 Review of the Tourism Policy of Sri Lanka', *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 144, pp. 229–236. doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.07.291.
- Kohn, H. (1944) *The Idea of Nationalism*. New York: Macmillan.
- Kuzio, T. (2002) 'The myth of the civic state: a critical survey of Hans Kohn's framework for understanding nationalism', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 25(1), pp. 20–93. doi: 10.1080/01419870120112049.
- Lecours, A. (2000) 'Space and Polity Ethnic and Civic Nationalism: Towards a

- New Dimension', *Space and Polity*, 4(2), pp. 153–166. doi: 10.1080/1356257002001367.
- Lisle, D. (2004) 'Gazing at ground zero: Tourism, voyeurism and spectacle', *Journal for Cultural Research*, 8(1), pp. 3–21.
- Liyanage, U. and Jayawardena, C. (Chandi) (2013) 'Towards a positioning strategy for tourism in post-war Sri Lanka', *Worldwide Hospitality and Tourism Themes*, 5(5), pp. 477–485. doi: 10.1108/WHATT-05-2013-0029.
- Lokuhetty, A., Jayawardena, C. (Chandi) and Mudadeniya, D. (2013) 'Developing a shared vision for tourism in post-war Sri Lanka', *Worldwide Hospitality and Tourism Themes*, 5(5), pp. 486–494. doi: 10.1108/WHATT-05-2013-0030.
- MacCannell, D. (1984) 'Reconstructed Ethnicity: Tourism and Cultural Identity in Third World Communities', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 2, pp. 375–391.
- Milman, A. and Pizam, A. (1995) 'The role of awareness and familiarity with a destination: The central Florida case', *Journal of Travel Research*, 33(3), pp. 21–27.
- Ministry of Economic Development (2011) *Tourism Development Strategy*. Colombo.
- Moss, G. (1990) Fallen Soldiers. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Moufakkir, O. and Kelly, I. (2010) *Tourism, progress and peace*. Oxon, UK: CABI.
- Muzaini, H., Teo, P. and Yeoh, B. S. (2007) 'Intimations of postmodernity in dark tourism: The fate of history at Fort Siloso, Singapore', *Journal of tourism and Cultural Change*, *5*(1), 28-45., 5(1), pp. 28–45.
- Nagel, J. (1995) 'Resource competition theories', American Behavioral Scientist,

- 38(3), pp. 442–458.
- Nairn, T. (1993) Demonising nationalism. London: London Review of Books.
- Nairn, T. (2012) 'Breakwaters of 2000: Ethinc to Civic Nationalims', in *Age of Extremes*. New left Review, pp. 91–103.
- Neumayer, E. (2004) 'The impact of political violence on tourism', *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 48(2), pp. 259–281.
- New York Times (2010) 'The 31 Places to go in 2010', New York Times, 10 January.
- Novelli, M., Morgan, N. and Nibigira, C. (2012) 'Tourism in a post-conflict situation of fragility', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 39(3), pp. 1446–1469. doi: 10.1016/j.annals.2012.03.003.
- Pannilage (2017) 'An Introduction to the Post-war Peace Building and Development in Sri Lanka Edited by', (March).
- Perera, S. (2016) Warzone Tourism in Sri Lanka. New Delhi: SAGE.
- Pi-Sunyer, O. and Salzmann, Z. (1978) *Humanity and culture: An introduction to anthropology*. Houghton: Mifflin Company.
- Pieris, A. (2014) 'Southern invasions: post-war tourism in Sri Lanka', *Postcolonial Studies*, 17(3), pp. 266–285. doi: 10.1080/13688790.2014.987899.
- Pizam, A. (1999) 'A comprehensive approach to classifying acts of crime and violence at tourism destinations', *Journal of Travel Research*, 38(1), pp. 5–12.
- Pizam, A. and Telisman-Kosuta, N. (1989) 'Tourism as a factor of change: Results and analysis', *Socio-cultural Study*, 1, pp. 95–100.
- Ranasinghe, R. (2018) 'Cultural and Heritage Tourism Development in Postwar Regions: Concerns for Sustainability from Northern Sri Lankan Capital Jaffna',

- Journal of Tourism and Recreation. doi: 10.12735/jotr.v4n1p1.
- Ratnayake, I. and Hapugoda, M. (2016) 'Tourism Under Military: A Critique on Land Utilization and Tourism in Postwar Sri Lanka', *Sabaragamuwa University Journal*, 15(1), pp. 18–35. doi: 10.1007/978-981-10-1718-6 22.
- Raymond, B. (1988) 'From ethnic to civic nationalism: English Canada and Quebec', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 11(1), pp. 85–102. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.1988.9993590.
- Samarathunga, WHMS; Cheng, L. (2019) 'Tourists' Experience Mapping
 After Visiting a Post-Conflict Destination Using TripAdvisor.com
 Reviews: The Case of Jaffna, Sri Lanka', in *International Research*Conference of Uva Wellassa University 2019. Badulla: Uwa Wellassa
 University, p. 585.
- Samarathunga, W. (2019) 'Research on the intangible ethnic tourism development after the civil war, based on stakeholder perspective: the case of Jaffna, Sri Lanka', *International Journal of Tourism Anthropology*, 7(3/4), pp. 218–240. doi: DOI: 10.1504/IJTA.2019.107317.
- Samarathunga, WHMS, Cheng, L. and Weerathunga, P. (2020) 'Buddhist gaze and power in a post-war destination: case study of Jaffna, Sri Lanka', *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/14766825.2020.1849241.
- Samarathunga, WHMS., Cheng, L. and Weerathunga, P. (2020) 'Transitional domestic tourist gaze in a post-war destination: A case study of Jaffna, Sri Lanka', *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 35(0), pp. 1–27. doi: 10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100693.
- Samarathunga, W. H. M. S. and Cheng, L. (2021) 'Tourist gaze and beyond: state of the art', *Tourism Review*, 76(2), pp. 344–357. doi: 10.1108/TR-06-2020-0248.

- Selvanathan, S. (2007) 'The effect of war and other factors on Sri Lankan tourism', *Applied Economics Letters*, 14(1), pp. 35–38. doi: 10.1080/13504850500425576.
- Shulman, S. (2004) 'The contours of civic and ethnic national identification in Ukraine', *Europe Asia Studies*, 56(1), pp. 35–56. doi: 10.1080/0966813032000161437.
- de Silva, K. M. (2010) 'Post-LTTE Sri Lanka', *India Quarterly: A Journal of International Affairs*, 66(3), pp. 237–250. doi: 10.1177/097492841006600301.
- Smith, A. D. (1995) *Nations and Nationalism in a Global Era*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Smith, A. D. (2009) *Nationalism: Theory, Ideology, History*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Smith, T. W. (2005) 'Civic Nationalism and Ethnocultural Justice in Turkey', *Human Rights Quarterly*, 27(2), pp. 436–470. doi: 10.1353/hrq.2005.0027.
- Sri Lanka Tourism Development Autority (2019) *Annual Statistica Report -* 2018. Colombo.
- Symonolewicz-Symmons, K. (1965) 'Nationalist movements: an attempt at a comparative typology', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 7(2), pp. 221–230.
- Tishkov, V. (2000) 'Forget the "Nation": Post-nationalist Understanding of Nationalism', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 23(4), pp. 625–650.
- Tjolle, V. (2011) Sri Lanka told to stop tourism land grabs, Travelmole.
- Triandafyllidou, A. (2001) *Immigrants and National Identity in Europe*. London: Routledge.

- Upadhayaya, P. K., Mu "ller-Bo"ker, U. and Sharma, S. R. (2011) 'Tourism amidst armed conflict: Consequences, copings, and creativity for peacebuilding through tourism in Nepal', *The Journal of Tourism and Peace Research*, 1(2), pp. 22–40.
- De Vos, G. (1995) 'Ethnic pluralism: Conflict and accommodation', in Romanucci-Ross, L. and De Vos, G. (eds) *Ethnic Identity: Creation, conflict and accommodation*. California: AltaMira Press, pp. 15–47.
- De Vos, G. and Romanucci-Ross, L. (1995) 'Ethnic identity: A psycho cultural perspective', in Romanucci-Ross, L. and De Vos, G. (eds) *Ethnic Identity: Creation, conflict and accommodation.* California: Altamira Press, pp. 15–47.
- Wickramasinghe, N. (2013) 'Producing the Past: History as Heritage in Post-War Patriotic Sri Lanka', *Economic and Political Weekly*, 48, pp. 91–100.
- Winthrop, R. (1991) *Dictionary of Concepts in Cultural Anthropology*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.
- Xenos, N. (1996) 'Civic Nationalism: Oxymoron?', *Critical Review*, 10(2), pp. 213–231.
- Yack, B. (1996) 'The myth of the civic nation', *Critical Review*, 10(2), pp. 193–211. doi: 10.1080/08913819608443417.
- Yang, L. and Wall, G. (2009) 'Ethnic tourism: A framework and an application', 30, pp. 559–570. doi: 10.1016/j.tourman.2008.09.008.
- Yoshida, K., Bui, H. T. and Lee, T. J. (2016) 'Does tourism illuminate the darkness of Hiroshima and Nagasaki?', *Journal of Destination Marketing Management*, 5(4), pp. 333–340. doi: 10.1016/j.jdmm.2016.06.003.